മിസ്റ്റർ കെ. പി. കണ്ണൻനായർ (*Secretary to Government*).— കുറച്ചുമുമ്പു് മെംമ്പർ കുസ്സൻ ഹോസ്പിറലിലുള്ള കുട്ടികളെ കാസ്മോ പോളിറ്റൻ ഹോസ്റ്റലിലേക്കു മാറ്റി അതിനെ സൌകര്യപ്പെടുത്തിയാൽ മതിയെന്നും, പെൺകുട്ടികളുടെ ആവശ്യത്തിനാണെന്നു പറഞ്ഞാൽ അവർ ഉടനെ അവിടെനിന്നും മാറുന്നതിനു വിസമ്മതം കാണിക്കുകയില്ല എന്നും ഇവിടെ പറയുകയുണ്ടായി. അങ്ങിനെ അവർ പെട്ടെന്നു ഒഴിഞ്ഞുതരുമെന്നു പറയുമ്പോൾ തീച്ചയായിട്ടും സൌകര്യപ്പെടുത്തിത്തരുവാൻ യാതൊരു പ്രയാസവുമുണ്ടാകയില്ല.

മിസ്സിസ് പി. മീനാക്ഷി എൻ. മേനോൻ (*Nominated*).— ബഹുമാനപ്പെട്ട ഗവൺമെൻറു സിക്രട്ടറിയവർകളുടെ മറുപടി കേട്ടതിൽ ഇതു് പ്രസ്സുചെയ്യാതിരിക്കുവാൻ നിവൃത്തിയില്ല. അതുകൊണ്ടു് ഞാൻ ഇതു പ്രസ്സുചെയ്യുകതന്നെ ചെയ്യുന്നു.

Motion was put and carried.

The whole demand less Re. 2 was put and carried.

20—Public Works—Cranganur—Rs. 13,494.

Demand was put and carried.

23—Medical—Rs. 3,86,320.

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao (*Chief Medical Officer*).—Sir, I rise to move for a grant of Rs. 3,86,320 under 23 Medical. I request the House will be pleased to grant the same.

Motion No. 31.

Mr. A. Narayana Menon (*Vyttila*).—"To reduce the allotment of Rs. 1,14,561 for establishment by Re. 1. *To indicate savings that the Department can make.*"

Sir, in discussing the budget I had laid stress on some items of expenditure which would enable the Government to make a good saving in the Medical Department. This is a department for which we have been very lavishly contributing funds and it is only proper that we should see whether we cannot, without causing any hardship to the patients that go to the Hospitals, effect some savings. As I have already stated, we can make something out of the patients who go to the different hospitals provided that they are rich.

Another suggestion that I made in general discussion was with regard to the payward patients and patients that go for

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

surgical operations. They may be charged something. Then with regard to the inpatients who are not payward patients; those who are in affluent circumstances may be asked to pay the dietary charges and charges for medicine. We shall make something.

Mr. A. V. Moothedan (*Chalakkudi*).—How to find out whether a man is in affluent circumstances or not?

Mr. A. Narayana Menon (*Vyttila*).—How are you to know whether a man has to pay income-tax or not? I am told that in Travancore, they are going to introduce similar rules. The doctor will be able to find whether a man is rich or poor. We have already one General hospital, one civil hospital at Trichur and we are to have a civil hospital at Mattancherri. Ernakulam, Mattancherri and Trichur are being towns where there are rich people. What I say is this: Let us make a beginning so that the requirements of the rural public may be made better. As it is, the rural medical officers are very poorly paid; they are not even able to meet the requirements of the patients for medicines prescribed even for a week. A little while ago, we heard that you should not spend too much for the urban population. Such of the urban population as can afford to pay may be asked to pay in the name of the rural population —in the name of "the village population" to borrow the expression of my learned friend the Hon'ble Member for Wadakkancheri. I request the house to pass this cut motion.

Mr. A. Eachara Menon (*Chittur Rural*).—Do you want to introduce the pay system in all the hospitals of the State?

Mr. A. Narayana Menon (*Vyttila*).—No. Only, in the General Hospital, Ernakulam and in the Civil Hospitals of Trichur and Mattancheri to begin with.

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan (*Wadakkancheri*).—Has the Government to say anything?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao (*Chief Medical Officer*).—Government will consider this question and be guided by the opinion of the House.

* **Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan** (*Wadakkancheri*).—Mr. President, now I will only quote my Hon'ble friend who moved the cut motion in the name of the villagers. I worked it out not haphazard, but worked it out carefully. If you are

* Speech not corrected by the Hon'ble Member.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

not able to find out a plan, ask us to give the plan. If you want it this evening I shall give you. You have got to work because you are paid. I charge the Government of Criminal negligence. What is it, that you are doing, I ask? You are spending lakhs and lakhs in the capital for building up palatial buildings, half worked buildings, unnecessarily started, but not able to be completed. I know your deficit. I know that you will not be able to pay up your commitments. Realise your position at least now. Therefore find out remedies. Intensively think about it. In the Finance Committee did we not tell you that this is one of our suggestions? Did you spend a thought over it since that date? Is this not criminal neglect? That is the mildest of mild expression to be used now. I will array all these criminal charges against you, and you will stand condemned before the world. I do not know what impression I have been creating here because my experience tells me that impressions cannot be created here but only motives. I ask and I ask seriously the Government of Cochin presided over by Sir Shanmukham will you on the floor of this House make out that I have motives? This is to dispel the volumes of volumes of motives attributed to me. How dare you to attribute motives to me? In the palatial residence that you have given to us during the short days that we are here do you know the provision made there? I tell you, for your information, to cater 17 or 18, there are two chokras given to us who are enjoying your hospitality on payment.

Deputy President.—The Hon'ble Member will confine his remarks to the point.

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan *(Wadakkancheri).*—I accept the suggestion of Mr. A. Narayana Menon, the Hon'ble Member for Vyttila who has given us a constructive suggestion. Don't ask us hereafter what is your suggestion? Here is a suggestion. Accept it. Work it. Save the villager and do away with your nonsense.

Mr. P. J. Alexander *(Palluruthi).*—Does the Hon'ble Member mean that the medicine given to out patients should also be charged?

Mr. A. Narayana Menon *(Vyttila).*—Not all the patients. Those who can afford to pay may be charged.

Mr. M. V. Cherian *(Mattancherri South).*—In spite of the thundering and lightning that has preceded me, the same expressions used by the Hon'ble Member for Wadakkancheri, I dare

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

to oppose this motion. My reasons are, there will be awful difficulty in making discrimination at the dispensing time whether the patients are rich or poor patients. This will cause inconvenience and delay. Generally, we find that rich people do not by themselves go to the dispensaries. They send their servants, their boys or somebody and there will be all sorts of discussion and the suffering patients will suffer for want of medicine. I beg to submit that the system of introducing payment for drugs that ought to be dispensed free from the hospitals will be a retrograde step. I do not know whether the Vyttila Member means that the people who undergo major operations in the hospital do not pay their doctors. This will be an additional taxation to make the people pay again to the Government. Under these circumstances, I oppose the motion.

മിസ്റ്റർ കെ. അയ്യപ്പൻ (*Ezhuvas South*).— ഞാൻ ഈ ഉപക്ഷേപത്തെ എതിർക്കുന്നു. ഇതിന്റെ അവതാരകൻതന്നെ പറയുന്നു, ഈ സംപ്രദായം നടപ്പാക്കുകയാണെങ്കിൽ ജനറൽ ആശുപത്രിയിൽ ഇത്ര വലിയ ചിലവുകളൊന്നും ഉണ്ടാകുകയില്ലെന്ന്. ആ കാരണം കൊണ്ടു തന്നെ ഇങ്ങിനെയുള്ള പരിഷ്കാരങ്ങളൊന്നും നടപ്പാക്കേണ്ട ആവശ്യമില്ലെന്നാണു ഞാൻ പറയുന്നത്. വിദ്യാഭ്യാസം, ഔഷധ സഹായം ഇവകളെല്ലാം സൌജന്യമാക്കണമെന്നു മുറവിളിക്കൂട്ടുമ്പോൾ ഇങ്ങിനെയുള്ള പരിഷ്കാരങ്ങളൊന്നും തൽക്കാലം വേണ്ടെന്നുവക്കുകയാണു നല്ലത്.

Mr. A. V. Moothedan (*Chalakkudi*).—I oppose this motion on two grounds. First of all, as the Hon'ble Member for Ezhuvas South suggested there are practical difficulties. How to find out whether a person is rich or not. Appearances are often deceptive. I fear it might even lead to corruption. Secondly, the policy all the world over is to make medicine free. Dr. T. S. S. Rajan, Minister of Public Health in the Madras Cabinet in his Trichinopoly address said that all the medical services should be free. My friend wants to have the reverse of it. It is a retrograde step and is not in the interests of the public. I therefore oppose it.

Mr. P. J. Alexander (*Palluruthi*).—I too oppose this motion. Generally persons who can afford to pay do not go to the Hospital it is only those who are not in a position to pay. We have already effected a point of economy by appointing honorary doctors. It is going to give a substantial saving. We shall be for the present content with that and wait for some time for the adoption of further saving operations. I oppose the motion.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao (*Chief Medical Officer*).—We will be gratified with the opinion of the non-official members of this House.

മിസ്റ്റർ എ. നാരായണമേനോൻ (*Vyttila*).— ഇതിനെ എതിർത്തു സംസാരിച്ച മെംബർമാർ ഇതു എങ്ങിനെയാണു തുടങ്ങേണ്ടതെന്നുള്ളതിനെക്കുറിച്ചു മനസ്സിലാക്കീട്ടില്ലെന്നാണു കാണുന്നതു്. ഇന്ന രോഗത്തിനു ഇന്ന ചികിൽസയാണെന്നു തീച്ചയാക്കുന്ന വിഷയത്തിൽ ഡാക്ടർമാക്കും ചിലപ്പോൾ ചില അബദ്ധങ്ങൾ വന്നുവെന്നുവരാം. അങ്ങിനെ വരുമ്പോൾ അധികമാളുകളും ആ ഡാക്ടരുടെ പടിയിൽനിന്നു വിട്ടുപോയേക്കും. ആശുപത്രികളിലുള്ള മിക്ക ഡാക്ടർമാരും ശമ്പളക്കാരാണു്. മരുന്നിനു വില വേണമെന്നുവച്ചാൽ പ്രൈവറ്റു ഡാക്ടർമാക്കു അല്പംകൂടി ഗുണമുണ്ടാകാനും ഇടയുണ്ടു്. ഞാൻ ഈ ഉപക്ഷേപത്തെ പ്രസ്താവിക്കുന്നു.

Motion was put and negatived.

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan (*Wadakkancheri*).—Poll, Sir.

Ayes	Noes
Mr. A. Eachara Menon	Mr. P. J. Alexander.
,, George Parakkal	,, K. Ayyappan.
,, C. R. Iyyunni	,, V. K. Krishnankutty.
,, P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan	,, K. S. Manikkam.
,, A. Narayana Menon	,, A. V. Moothedan.
	,, M. V. Cheriyan.
	,, K. S. Panikar.
	,, T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar.
	,, T. C. Iyyukutty.
	,, P. C. Varkey.
	,, V. K. Kutty.

Motion was therefore lost.

Motion No. 32.

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan (*Wadakkancheri*).—"*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 1,14,561 for establishment by Re. 1. To criticise the Government in their callousness in not providing for the improvement of the Wadakkancheri Dispensary in the Budget*".

Sir, I must preface my remarks,—although I know that I may not fail—before moving this cut motion that I am going to

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

press this. I am going to move this to make you feel. The motion I move is "to criticise the Government in their callousness in not providing for the promised improvement of the Wadakkancheri dispensary in the budget." Sir ever since it was my lot to be a member of this House ten years ago I was a novice then, I did not move any cut motion in 1103. But with the experience that I had gained after a period of 10 or 11 months, I had the privilage to sit with the Hon'ble Secretary now sitting there who now finds himself in an awkward position, it was a pleasure to work then, in 1104 Karkadagam I moved a cut motion requesting the Government to improve the Wadakkancheri dispensary. I was not able to present my case properly but I was not a fool to press the cut motion and take an adverse vote. So after explaining my position I withdrew my motion. Even during the four years of the Council—the term was extented because the Franchise committee was sitting then, now also you will do the same if you have the same sense of duty towards the people whom I represent and serve at Wadakkancheri because I am a practising lawyer, though poor I may be, I moved a motion and I began to gain strength. Last year and the year before last I was armed with all facts and figures. I interviewed the Medical Head on his return from the party at Cheruthuruthi and he had the goodness to visit the hospital and write his remarks in the book kept there. I saw you writing with my own eyes. Most of my recommendations were accepted. The nasty has been recorded in black and white that in that institution which goes by the name of the House of cure, I will call it the House of Curse, there is only a miserable provision for eight beds and there are a number of patients lying in the open verandah, cemented verandah, lying in the inclement weather on the 23rd of Mithunom on the three sides of the building. The patients suffered from various kinds of diseases, namely, typhoid, etc. I want the attention of the Hon'ble Member for Medicine here. Will you listen to me? I want my words to be heard. I want to see that they are acted upon by the Diwan. I know Sir Shanmukham is responsive to that because he has often stated like that. This is not a threat. It comes from the heart. I believe when you visited there were only eight beds. If my recollection is correct there were 40 patients. I happen to be an honorary visitor also to that House of Curse. It is unfortunate that I happen to be so. In that institution I see 39 or 40 patients suffering from all kinds of diseases lying scattered not even on mats but on the bare verandah. I am not charging the Medical Officer for that. He is a good man, a patient man and a man who feels for them. Don't think this is inspired by any one, this is inspired by feelings.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

It was our privilege on the 2nd of Kanni 1111 to enjoy the visit of His Highness the Maharaja to our place. His Highness' heart I know because I had the privilege of a conversation with His Highness for half an hour. It is denied to me now. Not by you, but by somebody else. If I am able to meet His Highness in person I shall be able to tell His Highness in person the misery of the people there. But you will not allow me. Now on that memorable day on the eve of His Highness' visit, it was a bright day due to His Highness' good luck as I put it, without going out of our way we presented an address in which we narrated all of our grievances. One of them was.

വടക്കാഞ്ചേരിയിലും ചുറ്റുപാടുകളിലുമുള്ള വില്ലേജുകളിലെ നിവാസികളുടെ ഏകാവലംബമായ വടക്കാഞ്ചേരി ആതുരാലയത്തിന്റെ ഇന്നത്തെ സ്ഥിതി നന്നാക്കിത്തരുന്നതിനും, അതിനു തിരുവുള്ളമുണ്ടായി അതിന്റെ വിപത്തുകൾ മാറുവാൻ കല്പനയുണ്ടാകണമെന്നും ഞാൻ എന്റെ നിയോജകമണ്ഡലത്തിനുവേണ്ടി എഴുതി വായിച്ച ആ മംഗളപത്രത്തിനു മറുപടിയായി ആ പൊന്നു തിരുമേനി കല്പിച്ച വാക്കുകൾ നിങ്ങളുടെ അപേക്ഷകളെ ഉടൻ നിവൃത്തിക്കുന്നതാണെന്നാണ്. ഇതു കന്നിമാസം രണ്ടാം തിയ്യതിയാണു നടന്നതു്.

His Highness told us that our needs will be attended to. After repeated requests I managed to get Sir Shanmukham to visit my place. It was on the 29th of Makaram 1112. I took him round the institutions which he wanted to visit. I asked him to visit the hospital and he did. He went round the hospital and do you know what he said?. I am sorry he is not in the chair. He said in reply to the address we presented that the hospital was started at a time when Wadakkancheri had not grown up so much. Now it has grown up out of all proportion. It requires a general improvement and it shall be attended to soon. Just before the budget and I invited his attention to the promise and wrote to the cool heights of Coonoor. I then went to the banks of the Bharatha river where he has received with caparisoned elephants, buntings and sand-strewn roads towards the close of last month. I repeated my request to him and asked him why he did not reply to my letter. He said that for want of funds the question has to lie over and that money is required for other purposes. After speaking on some other matters I came away. I am not foolish enough to say that I am making my last attempt. Even if I don't get it now I shall press the issue if I am here and if I am not here through the representative who comes here. I now place this motion before you for your consideration.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. V. K. Aravindaksha Menon *(Chief Engineer)*.—The Member for Wadakkancheri referred to the inspection made by the Diwan. I had also an opportunity to be with the Diwan during the inspection and he inspected the Wadakkancheri dispensary and he was convinced that funds should be provided if that hospital was not sufficient and he asked me to prepare estimates for a few buildings and I have submitted the cost report and plans. You will notice in the budget that a provision of Rs. 67,000 has been made for the construction of hospitals in the Cochin State. Government also indicated that it might be possible to provide for the Wadakkancheri hospital in the 1114 budget.

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan *(Wadakkancheri)*.—In the budget for the year 1114 or in the budget to be discussed in the year 1114?

Mr. V. K. Aravindaksha Menon *(Chief Engineer)*.—In the budget for the year 1114. So the position of the Government is that they have appreciated the necessity for the extension of the Wadakkancheri hospital and that they will, if funds permit, provide for the work in the budget for the year 1114.

* **Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan** *(Wadakkancheri)*.—The answer of the Government is that direction has been given to prepare estimates. The italicised figure of Rs. 67,000 is for the expenditure of Rs. 70,000 already incurred. Can I not get something from this? People say that Wadakkancheri is not getting because I am the Member of that constituency. When the Chief Engineer stated that provision will be made in 1114 I was a little hopeful. But he has qualified it by the phrase 'if funds permit'. You use that clause whenever you want to spend anything for anything useful. When you are spending lavishly for guest houses and things of that sort the clause if funds permit is forgotten. Don't you feel that you stand condemned? I know you stand condemned. I know I will get the unanimous vote of this House if I press this motion. But no. These things will be read by the outside world. I have placed before this House the cause of my country. I do not press the motion.

Motion was by leave withdrawn.

Speech not corrected by the Hon'ble Member.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Cut Motion No. 33.

Mr. A. V. Moothedan *(Chalakkudi).*—"*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 1,14,561 for Establishment by Re. 1. To request the Government to discontinue the practice of giving kanji, etc., in brass plates and to suggest that enamelled plates may be used instead*".

The object of the motion is only to request that enamel plates may be used instead of brass ones. Is there any objection?

Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao *(Chief Medical Officer).*—It is not brass plates that are being used. In all hospitals bell metal plates are used. In the first instance they are foreign and the chips will fall off very soon and they become rusty. These cannot be used for a long time. The bell metal plates can be used for a long time and even if they break they can be sold at half the price. It is even now used even in aristocratic houses. Therefore I use them.

Mr. A. V. Moothedan *(Chalakkudi).*—The bell metal plates become dirty and they might have chemical action. I do not press the motion.

Motion was by leave withdrawn.

Motion No. 34.

***Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan** *(Wadakkancheri).*—"*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 1,14,561 for establishmet by Re. 1. To press upon the Government to hasten the improvement of the District Hospital at Trichur as decided by the Advisory Board*".

Sir, I want to ask Government whether our decisions will be accepted. You have stated that the advisory committees are the beginning of constitutional reforms. I do not care whether it is shifted or not. My motion refers only to the improvement of the District Hospital at Trichur and not its transfer to any other place. It is a hospital which serves the northern portion of the State. The improvement of the Hospital has been decided upon by the advisory board. Today's Indian Express gives you a short comment about the constitutional reforms here. You won't study current politics. I want the Government to respect the unanimous decision of a body of men brought into existence by their executive fiat, to respect the feelings of board given unasked, a board which consist of two elected and one nominated Members. It is not only that. I also wish to see that the benign Government of Cochin makes adequate provision for the

* Speech not corrected by the Hon'ble Member.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

medical relief of not only the southern portions but also the northern portions of the State. I quote from the Hon'ble Member for Vyttila that men of the northern taluks are also men having all their feelings and miseries, diseases being one of them. Look at the Maharaja. He is not partial to anybody. All the subjects are same to him. His Highness has been pleased to visit some of our Villages. But you have failed to respect the decision of an unnecessarily constituted body. We have been insulted. To keep up the prestige of this body and more to keep up the name of our Ruler we though belonging to the northern Taluks must get something of good medical relief. To respect the feelings of the people improve that hospital. Make it as good as your General Hospital or at least approximate to it. I am not in any way concerned with the shifting of that, though the advisory committee decided that it should be shifted from the midst of the dust and din to a secluded place. We have pointed out that it is possible. I am deliberately avoiding the word shifting. I only want the improvement of the Hospital. I place this cut motion before this House for its serious consideration.

The House rose for the day at 5 p. m.

B. V. KRISHNANKUTTY MENON,

Secretary to the Council.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly